



CITY OF SANTA BARBARA

COUNCIL AGENDA REPORT

AGENDA DATE: August 11, 2009

TO: Mayor and Councilmembers

FROM: Transportation Division, Public Works Department

SUBJECT: Response To 2008-2009 Civil Grand Jury Report: *Trapped In The Granada Garage Elevator – Not An Uplifting Experience*

RECOMMENDATION:

That Council authorize the Public Works Director to submit the City's response to the report of the 2008-2009 Santa Barbara County Civil Grand Jury (Grand Jury): *Trapped in the Granada Garage Elevator – Not an Uplifting Experience*.

DISCUSSION:

State Penal Code Section 933(c) requires that the governing body of each public agency that is the subject of a report from the Grand Jury comment on the findings and recommendations contained in the report to the extent the findings and recommendations are relevant to the particular public agency.

Attached is the City's proposed response to the Grand Jury report: "*Trapped in the Granada Garage Elevator – Not an Uplifting Experience*." The recommended Council action will authorize the Public Works Director to submit the attached cover letter and response to the Grand Jury report.

ATTACHMENTS: Letter and response to the Report of the 2008-2009 Grand Jury: *Trapped in the Granada Garage Elevator – Not an Uplifting Experience*.

PREPARED BY: Browning Allen, Transportation Manager/VG/kts

SUBMITTED BY: Christine F. Andersen, Public Works Director

APPROVED BY: City Administrator's Office

Date

The Honorable J. William McLafferty
Presiding Judge, Superior Court
County of Santa Barbara
1100 Anacapa Street, 2nd Floor
Santa Barbara, California 93101

Santa Barbara County Civil Grand Jury,
Attention: Foreman Ted Sten
1100 Anacapa Street
Santa Barbara, California 93101

SUBJECT: Grand Jury Report: *Trapped in the Granada Garage Elevator – Not an Uplifting Experience*

Dear Judge McLafferty and Foreman Sten:

Thank you for sending the Grand Jury's letter to Mayor Marty Blum dated June 3, 2009, requesting a response to its 2008-2009 report: *Trapped in the Granada Garage Elevator – Not an Uplifting Experience*. The City appreciates the service the Civil Grand Jury provides to our community and has attached a detailed response addressing the year's Grand Jury concerns about the Granada Garage Elevator and related items.

This response was prepared by the Public Works Department as the operators of the City parking structures and lots and has been reviewed and approved by the Mayor and City Council. We believe the Grand Jury's report provided an opportunity to review and enhance the City's management of its elevators. We hope the Grand Jury is satisfied with our results and actions.

Please feel free to contact Browning Allen, Transportation Manager, at 805-897-2690, or Stephen Wiley, City Attorney, at 805-564-5326, should you have any questions concerning the City's response or need any further information.

Sincerely,

Christine F. Andersen
Public Works Director

VEG/kts

Attachment

c: Marty Blum, Mayor
James L. Armstrong, City Administrator
Stephen P. Wiley, City Attorney
Cyndi Rodriguez, City Clerk Services Manager
Browning Allen, Transportation Manager

**Granada Garage Elevators
Grand Jury Report Reponse
DATE**

1) **Finding 1:** The City of Santa Barbara lacks a coherent management plan for its elevator systems.

a) **Response:** The City of Santa Barbara (City) has a plan in place to monitor the maintenance of the City's elevators. The City has a contract with a qualified and certified elevator maintenance company, consistent with the City's purchasing rules. The contract clearly outlines the expectations and responsibilities of the contractor. However, based on input from the Grand Jury, the City has improved the elevator management plan by transferring the administration and oversight of the maintenance contract for elevators in our parking facilities to the Downtown Parking staff. We believe this plan adjustment will improve accountability when repairs are needed.

2) **Recommendation 1a:** That the City of Santa Barbara establish a coherent plan for its elevator systems.

a) **Response:** The City has an elevator maintenance contract with a certified elevator maintenance company. The contract clearly outlines the expectations and responsibilities of the contractor for maintenance of City elevators. (see response to Finding 1)

Recommendation 1b: That the City of Santa Barbara establish a single point of accountability for all elevator operations.

a) **Response:** At the time of the incident(s), the City's Facilities Maintenance Division was responsible for the operation and maintenance of all elevators in City facilities, including the elevators in the City's parking structures. As noted in response to Finding 1, this responsibility has now been transferred to the Downtown Parking staff in direct response to the Grand Jury Report.

3) **Finding 2:** The City of Santa Barbara does not maintain records of repair work performed by the contractor on the elevators in the City parking structures.

a) **Response:** Both the City and the maintenance contractor maintain records of all inspections, repairs, and maintenance work done by the contractor performing work on the elevators in all City facilities. Attached to this report is a copy of a typical maintenance report prepared by the elevator maintenance contractor (Exhibit A). Based on the input received from the Grand Jury, City staff adjusted the report to specifically include a line item for inspecting the phone. This was previously included in the report under the line item "Car Stop Switch (es)"; however, the elevator

emergency phone is now specified as a separate item to ensure that it is inspected.

- 4) **Recommendation 2:** That the City of Santa Barbara maintain records of repair work performed by contractors on elevators in the City parking structures.

a) **Response:** The City and the maintenance contractor maintain records of all repair and maintenance work done by the contractor performing work on the elevators in the all City facilities. As indicated above in response to Finding 2, the City has required the contractor to make a special note to test all City elevators' emergency phones so that the Downtown Parking staff can ensure that they are operational.

- 5) **Finding 3:** The audible alarm system in the Granada Garage elevators has limited range.

b) **Response:** The alarm system in every City elevator is installed per the industry safety standard. They are checked each month by the City's contractor, and annually by the State Inspector.

- 6) **Recommendation 3:** That the alarm system be modified to directly alert a responsible agency.

a) **Response:** The alarm system in every City elevator is installed per the industry standard. Modifying the alarm is not a solution for notifying emergency personnel of a problem in an elevator. The emergency telephone in each elevator connects the elevator passenger with a dispatcher who is available 24 hours per day and is trained to handle emergency situations. The dispatcher is directed to follow City elevator emergency protocols. As noted above, the City has adjusted the management plan and maintenance protocol to better ensure that the elevator emergency phones are working properly.

- 7) **Finding 4:** The emergency phone is not inspected regularly.

a) **Response:** The emergency phones are checked each month by the City's elevator maintenance contractor and annually by the State Inspector.

- 8) **Recommendation 4:** That the City of Santa Barbara perform and document weekly inspections and verify that the phones in all elevators are operational.

a) **Response:** The City contracts with a State-certified elevator maintenance contractor who performs monthly inspections of all City elevators, including all safety-related features such as the emergency phones. The contractor has a maintenance checklist (Exhibit A, page 2) that the field technician fills out when the inspection/eminence is performed. As noted above, Downtown Parking staff has directed the elevator maintenance

contractor to add specific documentation on their reports to show that the phones are being tested.

9) **Finding 5:** The City of Santa Barbara has no established written protocol for responding to elevator malfunctions.

a) **Response:** The City has established protocols for responding to emergencies. The December 5, 2008, incident provided the City an opportunity to review those protocols and institute revisions that will improve specific procedures and response times. The revised protocols have been reviewed by the City's Public Works Facilities Division and Fire Department. The City now contracts with an independent answering service to answer the elevator telephones. The answering service follows the City's protocols in responding to elevator emergencies.

10) **Recommendation 5:** That the City of Santa Barbara establish a written protocol for any elevator malfunctions.

a) **Response:** The City of Santa Barbara has established protocols for responding to emergencies (See response to Finding 5 above).

11) **Finding 6:** The City of Santa Barbara has no incident reporting system to address elevator malfunctions.

a) **Response:** The Downtown Parking Program has had an incident reporting system for over 10 years that is completed by the on-duty Parking Coordinator or Lead Maintenance Worker for incidents at any Downtown parking lots (Exhibit B). The report is reviewed by the Maintenance Supervisor or Parking Operations Supervisor and, if warranted, appropriate corrective action is taken.

12) **Recommendation 6:** That the City of Santa Barbara implement an incident reporting system.

a) **Response:** The Downtown Parking Program has had an incident reporting system for over 10 years that is completed by the on-duty Parking Coordinator or Lead Maintenance Worker for incidents at any Downtown parking lots (See response to Finding 6 above).

13) **Finding 7:** State of California Inspection Certificates in the elevators were out of date.

a) **Response:** The State of California performs the annual inspections of all City elevators. The certificate renewals from the State are posted as soon as they are received from the State.

The State is solely responsible for scheduling the inspections and issuing the annual elevator certificate. Any required repair work is coordinated between the elevator contractor and the State's inspector, and the permits

are then issued once all work has been completed to the satisfaction of the State.

14) **Recommendation 7:** That current State of California Inspection Certificates be displayed in elevators upon receipt.

- a) **Response:** City staff is committed to installing the inspection certificates as soon as possible. The City posts the State-issued elevator certificates as soon as they are received from the State.

15) **Finding 8:** The physical address of the elevator is not posted in all elevator cars.

- a) **Response:** The physical address is shown on the State certificate in each elevator car.

16) **Recommendation 8:** That the City of Santa Barbara post elevator locations inside all elevator cars.

- a) **Response:** The physical address is shown on the State-issued certificate in each elevator car. Additionally, the dispatcher who answers an emergency call from an elevator telephone has the ability to identify the elevator in question.

TEAM *Service*

Hydraulic Elevator Maintenance Tasks & Records

JOBSITE INFORMATION 2009

Job Name: PARKING LOT 7th
 Job Address: 1115 PARKER ST
 Route/Contract #: 300-378207 Elevator # 2 of 2
 Contract Type: Platinum Premier ☐ Platinum ☐ Gold ☐ Bronze ☐
 Building Manager/Supt.: _____ Location: _____
 Phone Number: _____ Ext.: _____
 Building Engineer: _____ Location: _____
 Phone Number: _____ Ext.: _____

EQUIPMENT DATA

Elevator # 2, State Installation # 51045, Unit Serial # _____
 Original Manufacturer: OW Controller Mfg.: _____
 Controller Name & Model: _____
 Controller Type: Simplex ☒ Duplex ☐ Group ☐ Other _____
 Landings/Opening: 44 Valve Mfg. Model: _____
 Door Equipment Mfg.: _____ Model: _____
 Pump Motor Mfg. & Model: _____ HP _____ Voltage: _____
 Supply Voltage: _____ Pump Mfg. & Model: _____ Belted _____
 Submersible: ☒ Main Piston Mfg.: _____ Packing Type & Sizes _____

The frequency of periodic inspections and tests are established by ASME A17.1-2007 (8.11.1.3 Periodic Inspection and Test Frequency) and may be superceded by your local authority having jurisdiction.

HYDRAULIC MAINTENANCE TASKS

Printed Name _____
 For the Year 2009 and
 Month Starting 1/09

LTB/LTB LTB/LTB LTB/LTB LTB/LTB LTB/LTB

Assigned Number of Years _____

Clean and Inspect Machine Room

Stopping Accuracy + or - [0.5 in]

Door Close Force [Torque] <30 lbf. #

Car Door Reopening Devices

Car Door, Gate Equipment, and Operator

Car Stop Switch(es), Emer. Communications, Signals/Buttons, Alarm (Optional Switch/ Buttons), Emer. Light and Ventilation

Clean and Inspect Car Top and Devices

Top of Car Operating [Insp.] Device, Incl. Stop Switch, and Light

Car Top Guide Shoes/Roller Guides

Leveling Devices/Hardware

Hoistway Doors, Tracks, and Door Locks

Pit Lighting, Stop Switch, Clean and Inspect Pit

Jack/Packing and Oil Recovery Device

Car Bottom Guide Shoes/Roller Guides

Power Unit Oil Level/Condition, Oil Leaks, and Belt Tension

Motor Starter Contacts/Connections

Traveling Cable[s]

Car Safety Device

Overhead, Car Top, and Hoisting Sheaves

Directional/Final Limits

Clean and Inspect Hoistway

Oil Lines, Supports, and Spring Buffers

Power Supplies

Motor Lubrication [Dry Unit]

Valve Strainers

Door Close Kinetic Energy

As required, inspect, observe, and adjust/maintain

Additional Items

PHONE



**City of Santa Barbara
Downtown Parking
Incident Report**
(805) 564-5656



Date of Incident: _____ Time: _____ am / pm

Weather: _____

Location: _____

Description of events: (Who, What, When, Where)

Mr./Ms./Mrs.: _____

Address: _____

Phone #: (home): _____ (work): _____ (cell): _____

Vehicle Description: _____

Witnesses: _____

Operator on duty: _____

Report Taken By: _____

Date: _____

Police Notified? _____

Report/Case #: _____

Photos Taken: _____

Supervisor Notified: _____

Date/Time of Notification: _____

Action Taken (investigation/corrective action/letters sent): _____

Reviewed by: _____

Dion Tait, Parking Supervisor